Welcome to the Revolution: the Global Rebellion against Elites

Jack A. Goldstone
Schar School of Policy and Government

GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY

 Revolution and Rebellion in the Early Modern World
Population Change and State Breakdown in England, France, Turkey, and China, 1400–1815
25th Anniversary Edition
Decline of the U.S.

• Nations that were the richest countries in their day suffered fiscal crises because elites preferred to protect their private wealth, even at the expense of a deterioration of state finances, public services, and long-term international strength. ... At [certain] times, elites have turned into competing factions ... starving the national state of resources needed for public improvements and international competitiveness. Factionalism within the elites ... paralyzed decision making. Struggles for prestige and authority took precedence over a united approach to resolving fiscal and social problems.

• The results are [growing public debts even as] private individuals among the elite have become enormously richer, while basic public services that support the economy as a whole—primary and secondary education, airports, trains, roads, and bridges—are neglected, overburdened, and deteriorating.

• The key element in this decay is not ... a decay of American manufacturing ability or of American foreign power, or a threat of imminent economic catastrophe; instead it is a steady erosion of public institutions and public services. This decay threatens to undermine the social and infrastructural foundations that supported American economic growth in the first three-quarters of this century. If unchecked, it is certain that the long-term results, which are now only slightly apparent but will accumulate rapidly in the coming decades, will be a relative decline in the living standards, freedom of decision, and international position of the United States as compared with other industrialized nations.  --- 1991
What has happened?

• Rising inequality, but inequality *per se* is not the problem

• *Stagnant real incomes and declining social mobility*

• Changing Labor market – far more temp jobs, fewer good jobs for low and med. skilled labor. Service sector now dominant; no longer gaining from increased productivity

• Access to key public goods/mobility goods is constricting: health, education, recreation, nutrition, housing/neighborhoods

• Educational polarization: Class & cultural capital enclaves. Loss of DIGNITY & respect. Less-educated voted for Trump NOT because they know less – they know very well what has happened to them. Less educated have been left behind and dissed by knowledge-worker elites.
Trump wins by county
The Elephant Curve (B. Milanovic)

![Graph showing global income growth, 1988-2008]

- **Rising incomes in emerging economies, mainly China**
- **Booming global elite**
- **Decline of developed-world middle class**
- **Very poorest locked out of growth**

**Global Income Growth, 1988-2008**

- **X-axis**: Percentile of global income distribution
- **Y-axis**: Real income growth

- **Poorest**
- **Richest**
U.S. Population aged 15-34--Annual Growth rate

* estimates
Immigration and Cultural Threat

• US History: Immigration restrictions come in response to larger volumes of immigration from new sources. (Gratton).

• In 1970: US was 5% foreign born; all minorities 16.5%. Today, 36%. Europe had Muslim <1% pop in 1970s; today 5-8%. Perceptions are at 20-30%!

• Median male age in US: 27 in 1970; 36 in 2015

• Large volumes of immigrants from new areas (Muslim and Asia/Africa). Driven in part by income convergence; in part by labor market needs; in part by more open immigration policies
AFRICA RISING: Working Age Population (15-59): (000s)
# Illustrations of Local Population Growth

(millions – Med/Hi/Constant)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2050</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>390/433/504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>94/106/144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niger</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>55/61/76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHINA</td>
<td>944</td>
<td>726</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(15-59)
Foreign Population (1st & 2nd Gen) % in 15-39 age group
The resulting view of what happened

• We have stopped making progress – what is holding us back when rich are getting richer, and global and local poor are getting richer? Why are almost all new firms founded in Dallas, Houston, LA, NY, Miami (London); rest of country more stagnant? Answer: they are taking what is ours. We are being tied down by international agreements that weaken and drain us, don’t benefit us. They = minorities, global elites, other countries, foreigners & immigrants. Experts & government have not helped us at all; only themselves

• Attitudes of anti-liberal elites: Living in a world of positional goods, so enough is never enough. Art, homes, jewelry, travel (Yachts, jets), extreme experiences. SO: we are being held back in a web of regulations, transfers, excessive taxes, intl. agreements. We want & deserve more.

• Anxieties – we are not safe (crime and terrorism); our national identity and culture is not safe (immigration and supra-national agreements and organizations); our economic future is not safe.
A Global Revolt against Elites

• Foundation is laid for a global revolt led by dissident elites and supported by middle classes AGAINST the prevailing international-liberal order (open world, multi-culturalism, no dominant moral rules). Goal is to recover national control – of borders, culture, security; restore vigor to national culture; win self-respect and recover honor.

• What does this have in common with prior revolutionary movements?
  1. A Coherent ideology – nationalism, nativism, toughness, anti-internationalism, anti-government, anti-regulation, anti-taxation
  2. Elite factionalism & dysfunctional government
  3. Mass mobilization by slogans, depicting elites as criminals and traitors. Only “I” can speak for and save “the people.”
  4. Comes as a surprise, but in hindsight is readily explained.
Revolutionary processes

• Appeal to those angry about blocked mobility, excessive taxes, dysfunction, cultural inauthenticity

• Attack the media, build revolutionary truth, attack anyone else as betrayers, traitors to national values. Familiar tropes (Marie Antoinette = Hilary Clinton; Charles I = Obama)

• Foment conflict internally and externally to appear necessary and enforce “us” vs. “them” outlook.

• Overturn normal procedures and rules, replace them with extreme decrees; target enemies and exalt friends. Competence matters less than loyalty. Act fast to change everything at once, or as much as possible as fast as possible, since everything has to be overturned and changed.
What is to be done?

• Long-term pressures have been building up for decades – immigration, inequality, social mobility blockage, declining rewards to low/middle skilled work. RESULTS OF DEMOGRAPHY AND INSTITUTIONS. Not just Trump (he is the symptom, not the disease). People are fed up, angry and want to break the system that they feel is strangling their future and leaving them unprotected. 90% Republican support for Trump’s first 2 weeks implies no easy way out.

• Counter-revolution usually doesn’t work; unless you have overwhelming force and can isolate revolutionary leaders (1848-49; Bahrain; Sisi in Egypt). Blocking, carping, acting like “we” have answers will make things worse.
What can be done?

• Embrace the revolution’s supporters. Show that there are REAL solutions that give them hope, dignity and value their needs. Show that Trump solutions will not do that, but make them poorer and less safe.

• Be REAL – Obamacare is in trouble, so are social security and medicare; so are state pensions. Need to find practical solutions for everyone, not just the poor.

• Find ways to address real needs for education, health, jobs, respect.

• Caution – if moderate measures fail, revolutions usually go in MORE radical directions, with purges, terror, and violence.

• Focus on processes and laws – preserve the Constitution at all costs. Pick battles carefully. Let some bad policies fail.
Longer-term solutions

• CHANGE THE DEMOGRAPHY: support education and women in Africa; show how immigration benefits everyone.

• Improve international institutions: get prepared for immigration pressures and environmental disasters. Limit refugees but provide support.

• Restore mobility and access to key public goods.

• Save the EU! Its failure will reinforce narrow nationalism for one or two generations.

• Be smart; recognize that Trump (Le Pen, Wilders) is just the messenger. This is not just a passing event. Need to change the context, isolate extreme leaders from supporters by changing their supporters’ views. Don’t just attack the leader; that usually reinforces their support. Press the debate on whether the leader’s actions help or betray their followers. Appeal to better nature of elites, followers.